

2025 TULANE INTERNATIONAL BASEBALL ARBITRATION COMPETITION

# REBUTTAL

*Cal Raleigh v. Seattle Mariners*



# Three Critical Points



1. The Mariners' overreliance on narrow metrics unfairly minimizes Raleigh's platform season and overall career contributions.
2. The use of flawed comparables fails to accurately capture Raleigh's unique performance and true market value.
3. The Mariners overlook the comprehensive impact Raleigh provides, both on the field and as a key contributor to their organization's success.

# Raleigh's Value Goes Beyond Average and OBP



While the Mariners emphasize Raleigh's inability to hit for average or get on base at higher than league average, these metrics are not the core of his value as a player. Instead, his elite power-hitting and exceptional defense define his contributions, showcasing the impact of a modern power-hitting catcher.

Raleigh	BA	OBP	HR	RBI	DRS
	.220	.312	<b>34</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>17</b>

# Raleigh: An Elite Two-Way Catcher, Unlike Sánchez

CAL  
RALEIGH



**Gary Sánchez**

1 SAE Salary (2020)  
\$5,000,000

Gary Sánchez, an offense-first catcher with -2 DRS in his platform year, is not comparable to Raleigh, whose 17 DRS and 5.4 fWAR showcase his elite two-way abilities. Raleigh's balanced impact on both offense and defense far surpasses Sánchez's one-dimensional profile, justifying a salary above Sánchez's \$5 million.

Player	fWAR	DRS	dWAR
Raleigh	13.9	32	3.4
Sánchez	10.2	5	2.0

# Raleigh's Superior Value Compared to Will Smith

CAL  
RALEIGH



**Will Smith**

1 SAE Salary (2023)  
\$5,250,000

Raleigh outperformed Will Smith in key areas during their platform years, with 34 HRs, 100 RBIs, and 17 DRS compared to Smith's 24 HRs, 87 RBIs, and 7 DRS, as well as a higher fWAR (5.4 vs. 4.3). Raleigh's greater durability, playing 153 games to Smith's 137, further supports a salary above Smith's \$5.25M, making his \$6M filing reasonable.

Player	Year	fWAR	GP	HR	RBI	DRS
Raleigh	2024	5.4	153	34	100	17
Smith	2022	4.3	137	24	87	7

# Posey: An Outlier, Not a Comparable

CAL  
RALEIGH



**Buster Posey**

1 SAE Salary (2013)  
\$8,000,000

We agree that Buster Posey's exceptional performance makes him far superior to Raleigh and others in the arbitration pool, rendering him an outlier rather than an appropriate comparable.

By referencing Posey, the team inadvertently highlights the lack of closer comparables to Raleigh's elite two-way contributions, further supporting his case for a significant salary.



## 4. Raleigh's Durability and Leadership

Raleigh's 464 games without an IL stint and clutch leadership, like his playoff-clinching home run, highlight his exceptional value.

## 5. Refuting the "Boom or Bust" Narrative

Raleigh's consistent power, elite defense, and 5.4 fWAR in his platform year debunk the "boom or bust" claim.

## 6. Market Context and Salary Justification

Raleigh's \$6 million filing is reasonable for a top-tier two-way catcher and conservative compared to market-adjusted equivalents like Wieters.

## 7. Raleigh's Role in Mariners' Success

Raleigh's offense and defense were pivotal to the Mariners' playoff runs in 2022 and 2023.



# Conclusion

Platform Year

Length and Consistency of  
Career Contributions

Past Compensation

Comparable Salaries

Existence of  
Physical Defects

Team Success